



REPUBLIC OF NAMIBIA

Ministry of Environment and Tourism

Evaluation Report

Servicing and repairs of Heavy Equipment's

Reference No:	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• NCS/RSQ/18-36/18-19• NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19• NCS/RSQ/18-38/18-19• NCS/RSQ/18-39/18-19• NCS/RSQ/18-40/18-19• NCS/RSQ/18-41/18-19
Date of Release:	06 August 2018
Closing date:	24 August 2018, 10h00

Table of Contents

BACKGROUND/BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF TENDER.....	3
APPROPRIATION/FUNDING DETAILS FOR TENDER.....	3
PROCUREMENT METHOD.....	3
TENDER OPENING.....	3
1. NCS/RSQ/18-36/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK CATERPILLAR HEAVY EQUIPMENT.....	4
2. NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK M.A.N. HEAVY EQUIPMENT.....	4
3. NCS/RSQ/18-38/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK DEUTZ HEAVY EQUIPMENT.....	6
4. NCS/RSQ/18-39/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK BELL HEAVY EQUIPMENT.....	6
5.NCS/RSQ/18-40/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK ASTRA HEAVY EQUIPMENT.....	6
6. NCS/RSQ/18-41/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK MICHIGAN HEAVY EQUIPMENT.....	7
RECOMMENDATION.....	8

Background/Brief Description of Tender

This tender was meant for the servicing and repair of the Ministries heavy equipments stationed in Okaukuejo, Etosha National Park (ENP).

Once these heavy equipment are serviced and repaired, they will be used for the maintenance of the gravel roads in the ENP. Some sections of the roads are currently in a bad state.

Tourism is a major contributor of Gross Domestic Products in Namibia. To maintain the frequent visit of tourists in the ENP, the ministry deems this tender a necessity to keep the roads in a good condition.

The Directorate of Planning and Technical Services (DPTS), the user directorate, made budgetary provision for this tender to be undertake in this 2018/19 financial year.

Appropriation/Funding Details for Tender

This project will be funded under the Development budget for the Capital Projects.

Procurement Method

The procurement method for this tender was "Request for Quotations for Non-Consultancy Services".

The tender was not advertised, but the directorate, after consultations with the Secretariat of the Procurement Unit, decided to send the tender documents to the list of companies that had replied to the ministries expression of interest for services.

The tender document was sent out on the 06 August 2018 via:

1. Email
2. For the documents that bounced back, the companies were called and they came to pick up the document.

Please note that the tender was advertised within the requirement minimum of 10 working days.

Tender Closing Date: 17 August 2018, 10h00

Extended Tender Closing Date: 24 August 2018, 10h00

All tenderers were informed via email and telephonically about the extension of time been granted by the Head of the Procurement Unit, from the 17th to the 24th of August 2018.

Tender Management Summary

Include details of the Tender Management Team and those members identified as forming the Evaluation Committee and any technical advisors used.

Tender Team consists of:

1. Mr. Boas Erkki (Chairperson)
2. Mr. Johannes Embula (Secretary Procurement Committee)
3. Mr. Ishmael Uusiku (Technical advisor)
4. Mr. Romeo Isaaks (Member)
5. Mr. Gerold Heins (Member)
6. Mr. Arnold Keeja (Member, on-leave)
7. Mr. Alpheus Ausiku (Secretary evaluation committee)

TENDER OPENING

Tender Box Opening Date: 24th October 2018, 10h30

Present:

- Mr. Alpheus Ausiku
- Mr. Mario Heibeb
- Mr. Michael Lubinda
- Mrs. Brunhilde Fischer
- Mrs. Sofia Toivo

Please note that all members have signed a conflict of interest and confidentiality form.

List of Tenders evaluated

1. NCS/RSQ/18-36/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **Caterpillar** Heavy Equipment
2. NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **M.A.N.** Heavy Equipment
3. NCS/RSQ/18-38/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **Deutz** Heavy Equipment
4. NCS/RSQ/18-39/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **Bell** Heavy Equipment
5. NCS/RSQ/18-40/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **ASTRA** Heavy Equipment
6. NCS/RSQ/18-41/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **Michigan** Heavy Equipment

1. NCS/RSQ/18-36/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK CATERPILLAR HEAVY EQUIPMENT

The Ministry received one (1) sealed envelop on this tender. The envelop were opened to identify the tender number which was not indicated on the envelop.

The envelop contained the invitation letter referring to tender No. NCS/RSQ/18-41/18-19.

It was found that the stamps on pages 5 and 8 of the tender document were tempered. Two different stamps were used: the manipulated referred to Fo-Sho the other one to Oshona Trackers. Page 5 contains the authorization for quoting which is not signed. Page 8 contains the letter of undertaking which was signed but filled in incorrectly since the full name of the owner/representative and the company name are not filled in.

It was further found that the signatures on Fo-Sho's and Oshona Tracker's documents are the same.

Since the use of a stamp is a legal matter, the letter of undertaking is not filled in correctly and the stamps were manipulated this offer was rejected by the evaluation committee.

As a result the tender No: NCS/RSQ/18-36/18-19: 'Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park Caterpillar Heavy Equipment' was not successful.

2. NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK M.A.N. HEAVY EQUIPMENT

Two bids were received for the tender No: NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19 as shown in Table 1:

Table 1:

Reference No.	Name of Tenderer	Amount (incl VAT)	Conformity Status (Y/N)
NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19	Autohaus Truck & Bus	N\$ 855,001.60	yes
	Mast's Garage	N\$ 525,807.04	yes

Messrs. Autohaus Truck & Bus submitted requested mandatory documents such as Good Standing Certificate and Social Security certificate having different company names. This should be clarified in case of awarding.

Mast's Garage submitted all mandatory documents in the correct way.

The completion and the submission of all requested forms were checked by the committee: both bids were found compliant to the tender document and qualifying for the financial evaluation.

Findings on the quotation of Autohaus Truck & Bus:

The bidder quoted by using its own software. The quotes are attached but for the replacement of the fire hose holding bracket for GRN 30018. The Priced Activity Schedule were filled in correctly although the unit rates were not filled in. No arithmetical errors were found. Services for which the bidder did not attach a separate quote were indicated as 'included in road worthy' or 'included'.

The quotation of Autohaus is valid.

Findings on the quotation of Mast's Garage:

The bidder quoted by using its own software. The quotes are attached but and clustering similar works like tyres and batteries. The quotation includes additional works which the bidder indicated as 'extra repairs as per meeting'. The bidder changed the quantity of tyres for GRN 30018 from 11 to 14 for the

lowbed and from 6 to 11 for the horse truck. This increasement was not considered during the financial evaluation. The tenderer did not sum his quotes on the Priced Activity Schedule.

In the bidding document he quoted N\$ 525,807.04 including VAT. After rectifying the quantities the offer change to N\$ 480,545.84 including VAT.

The quotation of Mast's Garage is valid based on the filled in unit rates in the Priced Activity Schedule.

Table 2			Autohaus Truck & Bus		Mast's Garage	
Description	Qty	Unit	Unit Price	Total	Unit Price	Total
GRN 30019 Water truck						
Repair rear water sprayer	1	each		17,329.00	4,250.00	4,250.00
Replace 11 tyres 1100 R20	11	each		82,222.93	5,494.00	60,434.00
Replace 2 batteries (683)	2	each	Included		2,583.75	5,167.50
Road Worthy Test	1	each		12,969.26	1,750.00	1,750.00
Extra as per meeting	1	each				1960
GRN 30018 Horse,GRN 30909 Loadbed						
Major Service	1	each		39,606.34	16,412.92	16,412.92
Replace tyres 1100 R20 (lowbed)	14	each		103,452.82	5,494.00	76,916.00
Replace mirror	1	each	Included		313.04	313.04
Replace Batteries	2	each	Included		2,583.75	5,167.50
Replace 6 tyres 315-80R22.5 (truck)	11	each		70,372.19	4,575.00	50,325.00
Replace fire hose holding bracket	1	each		5,000.00	980.00	980.00
Install hydraulic lift for loadbed ramps	1	each		91,243.85	71,760.00	71,760.00
Road Worthy Test (Truck + Loadbed)	1	each		54,981.19	1,750.00	1,750.00
GRN 30847 Flat bed						
Major Service	1	each		41,289.08	15,221.57	15,221.57
Repair tail gate	1	each		5,287.95	5,210.00	5,210.00
Replace 2 batteries (683)	2	each	Included		2,583.75	5,167.50
Replace 6 tyres 315-80R22.5 (truck)	6	each		40,375.75	4,575.00	27,450.00
Replace 80 km speed limit sign	1	each	Included		18.75	18.75
Replace Chevron plate	1	each	Included		225.00	225.00
Replace round lights with LED lights	2	each	Included		626.99	1,253.98
Road Worthy Test	1	each		40,273.76	1,750.00	1,750.00
Extra as per meeting	1	each				2,847.00
Extra as per meeting	1	each				37,873.78
GRN 31018 Water truck						
Replace 20 Chassis bolts	20	each	Included		63.81	1,276.20
Labour only (installation of leaf spring)	1	each	Included			
Replace 2 u-bolts with nuts	2	each	Included		1,533.95	3,067.90

Replace 7 tyres 315-80R22.5 (truck)	7	each		46,375.03	4,575.00	32,025.00
Replace 1 mirror	1	each	All repairs	54,959.41	313.50	313.50
Minor Service	1	each		42,741.08	8,441.81	8,441.81
Replace fire hose holding bracket	1	each			8,250.00	8,250.00
Extra as per meeting	1	each				9,645.00
Subtotal				748,479.64		457,222.95
VAT	0.15			112,271.95		68,583.44
Total				860,751.59		525,806.39

Table 2 shows the financial comparison of the two bids compliant to the evaluation criteria. The tender No. NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19: 'Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park M.A.N. Heavy Equipment' was successful and should be awarded to Messrs. Mast's Garage cc.

3. NCS/RSQ/18-38/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK DEUTZ HEAVY EQUIPMENT

No bids were received on tender No: NCS/RSQ/18-38/18-19: 'Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park Deutz Heavy Equipment'. This tender was not successful.

4. NCS/RSQ/18-39/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK BELL HEAVY EQUIPMENT

Only one (1) bid were received on this tender. The only bidder's company name is Fo-Sho Auto Repairs and Engineering. The envelop contains one bind document. The invitation letter attached is referring to tender No. NCS/RSQ/18-41/18-19. The Tax Good Standing certificate is valid until 6th September 2018.

The quotes received are referring to Astra trucks (NCS/RSQ/18-41/18-19) and M.A.N. Trucks (NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19).

The authorization to quote is filled in and initilized but not signed. The letter of undertaking is signed.

The signature seemes the same as the signatures on Oshona Trackers' quotation.

As a result of the findings above, the quote of Fo-Sho Auto Repairs and Engineering should be rejected as

- the quotation is referring to different tender documents,
- the submission is not compliant with Section I 9. of the tender document,
- the document is not properly signed,
- the tenderer obvisouly was involved in the preparation of Oshona Trackers' bidding document.

As per Clause 52.3.(a) & (b) of the Procurement Act the quote were find non-responsive by the committee.

The tender No. NCS/RSQ/18-39/18-19: 'Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park Bell Heavy Equipment' was not successful.

5.NCS/RSQ/18-40/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK ASTRA HEAVY EQUIPMENT

On this tender only one quotation were received from Mast's Garage.

The quotation for each equipment were checked against the services requested.

Requested were minor repairs, replacement of tyres and batteries for GRN 30904, GRN 30905, GRN 30908, GRN 30921 and GRN 30906. For all five (5) equipment the replacement of tyres and batteries

were requested. The attached quotations for each vehicle are including smaller repairs and the road worthiness for some of them but leave out required replacement of batteries and tyres etc. The Priced Activity Schedule was not filled. The quotations for each vehicle were attached. The attached quotations are summing up to N\$ 924,010.97.

Table 3:

Description	Quantity	Unit	Total
GRN 30904	1	each	31,989.68
GRN 30905	1	each	22,215.11
GRN 30905	1	each	33,948.67
GRN 30906	1	each	31,989.68
GRN 30908	1	each	31,989.68
GRN 30908	1	each	13,857.37
GRN 30921	1	each	637,497.61
Subtotal			803,487.80
VAT	0.15		120,523.17
Total			924,010.97

As it is very important for the Ministry to have this vehicles in running condition, the evaluation committee recommends to procure the missing deliverables as a separate tender.

6. NCS/RSQ/18-41/18-19: SERVICING AND REPAIRS OF ETOSHA NATIONAL PARK MICHIGAN HEAVY EQUIPMENT

On this tender only one quotation were received from Mast's Garage.

The scope of works requested as follows:

Item No	Brief description on Services	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Total Price
1	Repair Transmission GRN 30036 Bull Dozer	1	each	155,924.40	155,924.40
2	Replace seats GRN 30334 Water Truck	2	each	No offer	No offer
3	Replace tyres GRN 30334 Water Truck	11	each	No offer	No offer
4	Replace /repair air valve GRN 30334 Water Truck			No offer	No offer
	Other additional costs				
	Subtotal				155,924.40
	VAT			23388.66	23,388.66
	Total				179,313.06

The tenderer only quoted for the bull dozer (GRN 30036) and omitted the water truck.

The tender document is signed properly. The letter of undertaking and the authorization to quote is signed correctly.

The offered scope of works is according to the requested services in the bidding document.

Under the light of the above, it is recommended to appoint Messrs. Mast's Garage cc to repair the transmission of the bull dozer GRN 30036.

Recommendation

1. NCS/RSQ/18-36/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **Caterpillar** Heavy Equipment
The tender was not successful since the received bid was non-responsive.
2. NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **M.A.N.** Heavy Equipment
The tender was successful and should be awarded to Messrs. Mast's Garage cc for an amount of N\$ 525,806.39 including VAT and the increased number of tyres for GRN 30018.
3. NCS/RSQ/18-38/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **Deutz** Heavy Equipment
The tender was not successful since no bid was received.
4. NCS/RSQ/18-39/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **Bell** Heavy Equipment
The tender was not successful since the received bid was non-responsive.
5. ~~NCS/RSQ/18-40/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **ASTRA** Heavy Equipment
The tender was successful and should be awarded to Messrs. Mast's Garage cc for an amount of N\$ 924,010.97 including VAT. Procurement of missing deliverables should be done on separate tenders.~~ *Not to be included.*
6. NCS/RSQ/18-41/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park **Michigan** Heavy Equipment
It is recommended to appoint Messrs. Mast's Garage cc to repair the transmission of the bull dozer GRN 30036 for an amount of N\$ 179,313.06 including VAT.

It is recommended to the Acting Accounting Officer of the Ministry of Environment and Tourism in reference to the following bids:

- NCS/RSQ/18-37/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park M.A.N. Heavy Equipment (N\$ 525,806.39 including VAT),
 - NCS/RSQ/18-40/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park ASTRA Heavy Equipment (N\$ 924,010.97 including VAT) and
 - NCS/RSQ/18-41/18-19: Servicing and repairs of Etosha National Park Michigan Heavy Equipment (N\$ 179,313.06 including VAT)
- to award Messrs. Mast's Garage cc as a responsive bidder.

Non-responsive bidders

Hereby, notify the non-responsive bidders and return bids to respective companies in terms of Section 1 – Instruction to Bidders Clause 14 of the issued bid document.

[Signature] *J. B. Erkki* *2018/09/17*
 Name: _____ Sign: _____ Date: _____
BID EVALUATION COMMITTEE: CHAIRPERSON

Seimiy Christoph - Shuleke
 Name: _____ Sign:  Date: *26/09/18*
PROCUREMENT COMMITTEE: CHAIRPERSON

APPROVED/NOT APPROVED

[Signature]
 T. Nghitila
ACTING PERMANENT SECRETARY
